Building on Assessment
Gender and Women’s Studies
2009-2012

Presented by Jody Lisberger

Director and Associate Professor of Gender and Women’s Studies

NB: Because Gender and Women’s Studies took on this name May 2012 and because some of the included documents here derive from before this date, occasionally you will see WMS to mark the historical accuracy of the document.
Big picture goals: How and why does our teaching analytical thinking matter in big, long-term ways?

Our teaching analytical thinking and analytical habits of mind builds the foundational skills for developing self-awareness and welcoming and inclusive communities.

(In Aug. 2012, I went to a URI workshop on “developing welcoming and inclusive communities” presented by Jamie Washington. I took these notes from his presentation. The link to analytical thinking and teaching is mine.)

Needs for developing welcoming and inclusive communities: these overlap with teaching goals

- Authentic dialogue
- Awareness that emphasizing “inclusion” is not the same as emphasizing “diversity”; we need to emphasize inclusion
- Self-awareness as a key tool for building community
- Effective way(s) to engage and help others engage
Ways to create “inclusive excellence” speak to GWS priorities and goals of today’s assessment workshop

Ways to create inclusive excellence:

- Student, faculty, and staff focus on intellectual and social development
- Purposeful development and use of organization resources to enhance student AND faculty learning
- Attention to difference and the value it adds to a university and its communities
- Connect these above methods to institutional learning
Advice on achieving inclusive communities speaks to key elements of GWS pedagogy and collaboration

Advice for achieving welcoming and inclusive communities

- Even if you’re preaching “to the choir,” all choirs need rehearsals
- Model of crossing bridges is very useful—need to move conversations out of the room by using deliberate, intentional strategies
- Trust that dialogue takes us to a deeper sense of community
- Open new perspectives
- Encourage others’ participation
- Notice group dynamics
- “Show up” in your strength, whatever that might be
- Name your triggers and know you get triggered most when you don’t “show up”
- Take risks
- Be aware that it takes 7 years of intentional intervention before institutional behavior changes
- We do a lot of talking—what about action?
- Need to ask—What’s working? What’s not? What needs to change? Change it!
Developing deliberate, intentional strategies for teaching analytical thinking and writing

Everything we do as teachers impacts short-term and long-term goals of individual awareness, intentional thinking, and developing inclusive communities.

Possible questions (Jamie Washington) to begin conversations that open the way for building productive and inclusive communities:

- Find out where people are at: What’s up?
- Share: What’s your experience with social justice conversations?
- Share: What necessitates your being here today?
- Share: What are your hopes for our time together?
Welcome new and returning faculty

Based on surveys and information from Spring 2012 as part of our ongoing assessments, understand where our student strengths and weaknesses lie

Examine ways we can and need to teach students to interpret and analyze so they can be “more present, as thinking individual[s]” (Harvey)

Look at specific examples of how we can better engage students and teach them key analytical habits of mind through some of the following approaches:

- Emphasize interpretation skills
- Teach patterns of writing to help students represent argument and evidence
- Use reflective critical thinking questions to get them to rethink their habits.
- Create explicit steps for collecting and analyzing evidence.

Examine our own syllabi to see where we can better incorporate the teaching of these skills into our lesson plans

Create a stronger base and progression from GWS 150 to 300-level GWS courses
How has assessment affected us? Growth!
Where do our majors come from?

WMS: Percentages of Other Majors
February 2012

- PSY: 34%
- HDF: 8%
- ENG: 8%
- HIS: 4%
- HLT: 4%
- MUS: 2%
- NUR: 2%
- SOC: 9%
- THE: 2%
- TMD: 2%
- APG: 2%
- BIO: 2%
- BUS: 2%
- COM: 2%
- ECN: 2%
- EDC: 9%
Why did you choose to major or minor in WMS?

- Prepare me for doing research
- Prepare me for desired job
- Prepare me for graduate school
- Understand my life
- Help to change society
- Understand soc. forces/ind. Rel.
- Enjoyed first course
- Interesting Concepts
Which of the following skills or abilities did you gain as a WMS major or minor? The ability to:

- Interpret the results of data gathering
- Use comp. resources to develop a biblio.
- Write a report or research paper
- Evaluate diff. research meth.
- Develop evidence-based arg.
- Identify ethical issues
Overall, how satisfied were you with the following aspects of your education in WMS?

- Overall satisfaction
- Access to technology
- Ease in seeing faculty outside of
- Quality of teaching
- Getting courses needed to
- Interaction with fellow majors/
- Undergraduate advising
- Career advising
- Graduate school advising

Legend:
- Very Satisfied
- Satisfied
- Somewhat satisfied
- Somewhat Dissatisfied
- Dissatisfied
- Very Dissatisfied

- Prioritize WMS student learning outcomes
- Identify course assignments that address learning outcomes
- Review ‘07 –’08 WMS 150 outcomes assessment
- Re-evaluate and/or reaffirm merit of current outcomes
- Establish 2 – 3 learning outcomes for new assessment
- Develop a common plan for assessing program outcomes
Establishing Learning Outcomes

Knowledge: Women’s Studies as an Academic Field

Diversity: Women’s Studies as a Global and Multicultural Field of Study

Analysis & Synthesis: Societal Institutions and Power Structures in Women’s Lives

Activism: Improving Women’s Lives

Skill Development: Communication Across Formats
Curricular mapping in progress
Curricular mapping in progress
## Outcomes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1) Knowledge:</th>
<th>NB</th>
<th>JB</th>
<th>AE</th>
<th>KS</th>
<th>EJ</th>
<th>JL</th>
<th>LM</th>
<th>KQ</th>
<th>LW</th>
<th>DH</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Recognize the transdisciplinary character of women’s studies</strong></td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Describe the history of women’s movements and women’s studies as a discipline</strong></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Discuss major concepts &amp; assumptions of feminist study</strong></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Describe major theories &amp; theorists in women’s studies</strong></td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Identify diverse epistemological &amp; methodological approaches</strong></td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Legend:**
- **1** = most important
- **2** = fairly important
- **3** = less important
## Curricular Mapping WMS 150

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Outcomes</th>
<th>NB</th>
<th>JB</th>
<th>AE</th>
<th>KS</th>
<th>EJ</th>
<th>JL</th>
<th>LM</th>
<th>KQ</th>
<th>LW</th>
<th>DH</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2) Diversity:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recognize the intersections between gender and other social &amp; cultural identities including race, ethnicity, national origin, religion, class, ability, sexuality, age, etc.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Articulate connections between global, regional &amp; local issues affecting women</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recognize women’s rights as human rights in global, regional &amp; local contexts</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Discuss the importance of context for understanding and interpreting women’s experiences</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Legend:**

- 1 = most important
- 2 = fairly important
- 3 = less important
## Curricular Mapping WMS 150

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Outcomes</th>
<th>WMS 150</th>
<th>WMS 150</th>
<th>WMS 150</th>
<th>WMS 150</th>
<th>WMS 150</th>
<th>WMS 150</th>
<th>WMS 150</th>
<th>WMS 150</th>
<th>WMS 150</th>
<th>WMS 150</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3) Analysis &amp; Synthesis</td>
<td>NB</td>
<td>JB</td>
<td>AE</td>
<td>KS</td>
<td>EJ</td>
<td>JL</td>
<td>LM</td>
<td>KQ</td>
<td>LW</td>
<td>DH</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Recognize societal institutions and power structures that occur within Patriarchal Society</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Analyze the ways in which these institutions and structures impact the Material realities of women’s lives</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Identify the intersection of coursework and the student’s personal experience</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Legend:  
1 = most important  
2 = fairly important  
3 = less important
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Outcomes</th>
<th>NB</th>
<th>JB</th>
<th>AE</th>
<th>KS</th>
<th>EJ</th>
<th>JL</th>
<th>LM</th>
<th>KQ</th>
<th>LW</th>
<th>DH</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4) Activism</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recognize the historical and contemporary struggles to achieve social justice and human rights</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Develop ways to address societal and power inequalities to improve women’s status</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Engage in promoting social justice and human rights</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Outcomes</td>
<td>WMS 150</td>
<td>WMS 150</td>
<td>WMS 150</td>
<td>WMS 150</td>
<td>WMS 150</td>
<td>WMS 150</td>
<td>WMS 150</td>
<td>WMS 150</td>
<td>WMS 150</td>
<td>WMS 150</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>---------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5) Skill Development**</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Demonstrate adequate skills in listening, speaking, writing, and presenting effectively</em></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Demonstrate critical thinking about complex issues</em></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Evaluate and interpret information from a variety of sources, including print and electronic media, film, video, and other information technologies</em></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# GWS 150 Rubric: Workshop Results 9.1.09:
Operative word: “Identifies”

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Criteria</th>
<th>Exceeds Standard</th>
<th>Meets Standard</th>
<th>Does Not Meet Standard</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>KNOWLEDGE:</strong> Discuss major concepts and assumptions of feminist study</td>
<td>Identifies &amp; explains well many concepts and assumptions</td>
<td>Accurately identifies &amp; describes some major concepts &amp; assumptions</td>
<td>Insufficiently identifies major concepts &amp; assumptions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Evaluates concepts &amp; assumptions, resulting in original thought</td>
<td>Provides some details &amp; examples of major concepts &amp; assumptions</td>
<td>Provides little or no detail; does not demonstrate understanding</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>DIVERSITY:</strong> Recognize the intersections between gender and other social and cultural identities including race, ethnicity, national origin, religion, class, ability, sexuality, age, etc.</td>
<td>Identifies and discusses examples, and suggests implications of intersections</td>
<td>Identifies and provides some examples and references the intersections</td>
<td>Identifies few examples and does not discuss intersections</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>ANALYSIS &amp; SYNTHESIS:</strong> Analyze the ways in which societal institutions and power structures impact the realities of women’s lives</td>
<td>Identifies &amp; analyzes the impact of societal institutions &amp; power structures on women’s lives, using many examples</td>
<td>Identifies some societal institutions &amp; power structures &amp; provides some examples of the impact on women’s lives</td>
<td>Identifies few or no societal institutions and power structures, and provides few or no examples of the impact on women’s lives</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Next steps for GWS 150

- Make sure we all teach to facilitate “identifying” issues and using examples
- Incorporate explicit steps in pedagogy to begin learning how to teach students how to analyze
- Provide guidance for all teachers for developing three different kinds of writing assignments where we teach students how to find and represent their thinking selves:
  1. Writing at an angle: How to interview and shape an essay with a particular angle (Shero)
  2. Viewpoint: How to represent another author’s ideas and how to respond: Summary and Analysis/Response
  3. Action project: How to combine research and action
Teaching GWS 150: Approaching Analysis
“What one does with ‘data’ when one goes beyond observing and summarizing—one takes it apart, grapples with its details, draws out the significance or implication not apparent to a superficial view. Analysis is what makes the writer feel present, as a thinking individual, in the essay.”
Common reasons students lose their “thinking selves”

- They start assignments and papers late because they dislike “research” or are lazy
- They don’t take the time to collect and/or analyze the evidence
- They’ve make up their minds already
- They get overwhelmed by quotes
- They write in a manner that doesn’t open up “my space”
- They also have become disenchanted with school
- They also haven’t been taught how to find and represent “their selves” in the process of education
Helping students find and represent their thinking selves.

We need to create deliberate teaching measures to help students:

- They start late because they dislike “research” or are lazy: Break down the research assignments into parts; create an exercise where they get excited or surprised by taking time to interpret.

- They don’t take the time to collect and/or analyze the evidence: Create explicit steps for collecting and analyzing evidence.

- They’ve make up their minds already: Use reflective critical thinking questions to get them to rethink their habits; show them the difference between summarizing and analyzing.

- They get overwhelmed by quotes: Teach how to use key parts of the quotes and work their prose around it; teach how to construct an attribution paragraph.

- They write in a manner that doesn’t open up “my space”: Teach a model that forces students to open up “my space” by deliberately focusing on “the other” space first.
Helping students find and represent their thinking selves.

We need to create deliberate teaching measures to help students:

- They start late because they dislike “research” or are lazy: **Break down the research assignments into parts**; create an exercise where they get excited or surprised by taking time to interpret.

- They don’t take the time to collect and/or analyze the evidence: **Create explicit steps for collecting and analyzing evidence**.

- They’ve make up their minds already: **Use reflective critical thinking questions to get them to rethink their habits**; show them the difference between summarizing and analyzing.

- They get overwhelmed by quotes: **Teach how to use key parts of the quotes and work their prose around it**; teach how to construct an attribution paragraph.

- They write in a manner that doesn’t open up “my space”: **Teach a model that forces students to open up “my space”** by deliberately focusing on “the other” space first.
If we want students to be deliberate and intentional, and to recognize the “process” side of analysis, we need to set up assignments that delineate steps: goal, plan, possible approaches, possible questions, etc.

GWS 150: Shero Essay Assignment—A Woman You Admire

The final essay should be 3-5 pages (750-1,250 words), typed, double-spaced, paginated (include page numbers), and stapled. PROJECT PLAN (see questions at the end of assignment) DUE SEPT. x, in class, typed. Rough draft DUE Sept x, in class. Bring 2 copies Final draft DUE Oct. x, in class.

Goal of Essay: To interview a woman who is a (s)hero in your life and to use your information to write an essay that illuminates the struggles and successes of being a woman today. Because this is a Gender and Women’s Studies class, and a class specifically studying the socialization of gender and how gender expectations affect women’s choices and lives, your questions and essay need to address issues pertinent to our class.
Specify Key Issues pertinent to GWS 150 that you must address:

- The socialization processes through which we learn “gender”
- Issues relevant to women locally, nationally, and globally
- The ways social institutions and power structures impact the material realities and aspirations in women’s lives
- The intersection of gender with other social and cultural identities such as race, ethnicity, class, sexuality, age, ability, and disability, and the ways these intersections further influence female experience
- The gender dynamics that underlie economic, environmental, health, personal, political, sexual, and social oppressions
- The ways feminism enhances the lives of women and men
Plan: How you decide to shape the essay is up to you. You might:

- Start with a vivid scene that you think captures the essence of your subject and then go on to explain and show more about her, emphasizing her key traits and nuances as you depict and reflect on the ups and downs of her life as a woman.
- Start by focusing on the central trait that makes her a woman to admire, and then go on to show how this trait recurs in several different scenes and places in her life, and so yours.
- Narrate her life, emphasizing the most significant moments that have helped or hindered her in being a woman, and reflecting on how you see these moments as relating to Women’s Studies issues.
- Start with a really strong quote from her and then go on to show her full character, using her answers to your questions to shape a full portrayal of her and reveal how her experience speaks to the ups and downs of being a woman.
- Start with the first time you met or knew her and go from there to discuss how your relationship deepened and changed over time, and how you see this person struggling with or overcoming the situations and choices that women face.
- Focus on the interview and what you gleaned about her and the struggles and successes of being a woman in the process.
- Do something else.
Shero essay assignment parts

**Pointers:** Whatever you do:

- **Be particular, probing, and vivid as you try to recreate her in such a way that we come to know her details and admire her, too**

- **Remember that good writing involves EXPOSURE (taking a vivid picture of a person, scene, or moment) and REFLECTION (taking time to think out loud, to let us see and feel the depth of your and her thought as you reflect on her and as she reflects on women’s issues in her life)**

- **You may NOT use a question and answer format. Write an essay, using full paragraphs with a purposeful sense of progression**
Shero essay assignment parts

**Possible interview questions to ask:** To help you see the direction your essay needs to go, here are possible questions to choose from, but please also add your own:

- What have been the struggles you’ve faced because you’re a woman?
- Who taught you what girls and women could/should and couldn’t do in their lives? Any specific examples or formative moments?
- What are the moments you are most proud of in your life? How has or does being a woman play into those moments?
- If you could give advice today to girls or women college students, what would that advice be?
- Were there/are there any moments in your life when you’ve felt restrained by being a girl or a woman? What were/are they? What did you do? Would you respond the same way today?
- Are there moments in your life when you did things as a girl or woman that people didn’t expect a girl or woman to do? What were/are those moments? What made you act in the way you did?
Shero essay assignment parts

Possible interview questions to ask (con’t):

- How much do you think society’s expectations of what girls/women and boys/men should do has affected your choices and behavior in life?
- How has being a girl/woman worked to your advantage in life? Your disadvantage?
- Who was/were your role model(s)? Why?
- Growing up, were the boys and girls, women and men, in your family treated the same? What were the similarities? The differences? What do you think about them?
- How has growing up with non-American parents or cultures influenced your choices as a woman?
- What values about women and men have you tried to teach your child(ren) and family members?
- How has the issue of (the environment/health/the media/global policy/the workplace/Rl) affected you as a woman? Do you think this issue affects women differently from men?
Project Plan DUE TYPED, Sept. x, in class.

- Who do you plan to interview? What relation is this person to you?
- Why are you choosing this person? What do you want me to understand and admire about her? What do you find most interesting about her? (Respond casually but at length.)
- Describe this person to me so vividly I could draw a picture of her.
- Provide a list of 15 questions you plan to ask (or have already asked) your subject. Try to have your questions pertain to issues related to being a woman in the past, present, and future. Which question(s) do you like the most? The least? Can you think of a few more interesting questions to ask? What are they?
- When do you plan to conduct your first interview?
- Which of the above writing plans might you follow? Or if doing something different, what might that be?
To encourage “process” thinking:

- Need to encourage students to write a draft and workshop it with classmates by making draft and writers workshop part of the process.
- Need to provide a sheet of questions for students to answer as they read each others’ essays (3 to a group works great).
- Need to model a few possible revision approaches (not too much to overwhelm, just a few key lessons, such as Topic Sentences and Paragraph closings).
- Need to give students a revision contract asking them to complete a checklist of items to do as part of the revision process.
- Need to give students the rubric for the assignment early in the process.
- Need to assign final analytical questions for the essay that reflect the experience of greater reflection on their essays and others.
Shero essay revision tips

1) Make sure your paragraphs have topic sentences, so the paragraphs don’t float without a sense of purpose. Connect each topic sentence, and so paragraph, to the purpose of the assignment.

Example #1 Original:

Born amidst the attack on Pearl Harbor, Carole Gunning was brought into this world on October 23, 1941. The youngest of two children, with a brother 18 years her senior, she faced hardship at an early age, with the death of her father of kidney disease when she was only three years old. His death hugely influenced her life, for through the lack of a father figure, she learned all she could from observing her mother and, later, her grandchildren’s relationships with their fathers.

Revision:

From the start of her life, Carole learned about the strengths and struggles of being a woman. Born amidst the attack on Pearl Harbor, she was brought into this world on October 23, 1941. The youngest of two children, with a brother 18 years her senior, she faced hardship at an early age, with the death of her father of kidney disease when she was only three years old. His death hugely influenced her life, for through the lack of a father figure, she learned all she could from observing her mother and, later, her grandchildren’s relationships with their fathers.
**Shero essay revision tips**

Connect each topic sentence, and so paragraph, to the purpose of the assignment.

**Example #2 Original:**

Self-described as a “lonely child,” Carole escaped home responsibilities as an obedient child through her academics. Attending a public school in Brighton, she loved to read and learn. It was there she met Bill Gunning, her future husband. The boyfriend of Carole’s best friend, the two had always liked each other. Following her friend and Bill’s break-up, they began dating and have been together ever since.

**Revision:**

*Carole’s strengths as a woman and her intellectual resources started early through her schooling.* Self-described as a “lonely child,” Carole escaped home responsibilities as an obedient child through her academics. Attending a public school in Brighton, she loved to read and learn. It was there she met Bill Gunning, her future husband. The boyfriend of Carole’s best friend, the two had always liked each other. Following her friend and Bill’s break-up, they began dating and have been together ever since.
2) Close each paragraph in a way that shows your reader you haven’t forgotten the purpose of your essay or the topic and focus of the paragraph at hand. Often using reflection (thinking aloud) allows you to connect to key terms and purpose, create depth, and build weight to your argument or essay.

Original: Carole’s strengths as a woman and her intellectual resources started early through her schooling. Self-described as a “lonely child,” Carole escaped home responsibilities as an obedient child through her academics. Attending a public school in Brighton, she loved to read and learn. It was there she met Bill Gunning, her future husband. The boyfriend of Carole’s best friend, the two had always liked each other. Following her friend and Bill's break-up, they began dating and have been together ever since.

Revision: Carole’s strengths as a woman and her intellectual resources started early through her schooling. Self-described as a “lonely child,” Carole escaped home responsibilities as an obedient child through her academics. Attending a public school in Brighton, she loved to read and learn. It was there she met Bill Gunning, her future husband. The boyfriend of Carole’s best friend, the two had always liked each other. Following her friend and Bill’s break-up, they began dating and have been together ever since. When Carole looks back on this early dating scene, she realizes in some way how caught she was in traditional notions of dating and marriage, but she also knows one reason she liked Bill, and he liked her, was because of her academic independence as a woman.
**Shero essay rubric:** sharing rubrics with students in advance is always good to give them goals and language for naming goals.

---

**GWS 150 Shero Project: Writing From an Angle Rubric**

**Criteria:**
- **Cognitive skills:** understand the difference between using evidence/detail and reflecting on/interpreting evidence; learn to write “from an angle”

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Criteria</th>
<th>Exceeds</th>
<th>Meets</th>
<th>Does not meet</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Uses evidence particularly and appropriately</strong></td>
<td>Writer uses vivid, particular, and compelling, language, surprising and delighting the reader by the detail used to depict the Shero and convey her life as a woman.</td>
<td>Writer chooses and emphasizes details relevant to and particularly valuable for probing the issues and concerns of WMS.</td>
<td>Writer uses language that is mostly vague or clichéd; and/or the essay doesn’t have enough details.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Evaluator evidence critically; uses reflection, insight, and interpretation to discuss the Shero’s life as it speaks to, amplifies, and interrogates the concerns of WMS 150</strong></td>
<td>Writer reflects with considerable depth and insight so as to reveal the significance of the Shero’s life in terms of concerns and issues relevant to WMS 150.</td>
<td>Writer demonstrates deliberate attempts to shift from recounting detail to reflecting on it, or vice versa, thereby revealing an understanding of WMS issues and concerns and adding weight and impact to the essay and the treatment of the Shero’s life.</td>
<td>Writer still needs to make deliberate shifts from using detail to reflecting on it, and vice versa, so as to give the essay depth and weight.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Writer uses evidence from the Shero’s life (experiences, quotes, Shero’s thoughts, etc.) to probe, question, grapple with, and amplify some of the complexities involved in being a woman and facing WMS issues and concerns</strong></td>
<td>Writer uses evidence from the Shero’s life (experiences, quotes, Shero’s thoughts, etc.) to begin to probe some of the complexities involved in being a woman.</td>
<td>Writer uses evidence from the Shero’s life (experiences, quotes, Shero’s thoughts, etc.) to probe, question, grapple with, and amplify some of the complexities involved in being a woman and facing WMS issues and concerns.</td>
<td>The writer doesn’t make enough connections between evidence from the Shero’s life and WMS issues so the details don’t contribute enough to a full and probing understanding of WMS issues and concerns.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Conclusion goes beyond the assignment and offers some insightful, perhaps surprisingly original, and thought-provoking final ideas.</strong></td>
<td>Conclusion offers some thought-provoking final ideas.</td>
<td>Conclusion lacks some thought-provoking final ideas.</td>
<td>Essay lacks a conclusion or the conclusion doesn’t close the essay adequately.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Demonstrates clear, persuasive, thoughtful, and grammatically correct writing:</strong> evidence of deliberate structure and organization, ability to carry through the key ideas and threads, and correct writing mechanics</td>
<td>Essay has deliberate and compelling shape as it moves between detail and reflection with smooth progress, logical flow of ideas, paragraphs, and sentences, and sometimes surprising and original connections and turns. Essay is a pleasure to read from start to finish.</td>
<td>Essay proportions the use of detail and reflection or interpretation to maximize the impact of both.</td>
<td>Essay faces serious problems in the area of structure (confusing), use of details or evidence (nonexistent or weak), language (the sentences often are awkward, don’t connect, or contradict each other), and/or mechanics (punctuation, spelling, grammar have several mistakes).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Essay proportions the use of detail and reflection or interpretation so neither aspect feels short-changed or overwhelming.</strong></td>
<td>Essay proportions the use of detail and reflection or interpretation so neither aspect feels short-changed or overwhelming.</td>
<td>Essay proportions the use of detail and reflection or interpretation so neither aspect feels short-changed or overwhelming.</td>
<td>The writing doesn’t move forward but keeps repeating the same details or main points, or touches on many things but without a sense of progress or depth.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>There are no errors in punctuation, grammar, or spelling.</strong></td>
<td>There are only a few errors in punctuation, grammar, and/or spelling.</td>
<td>There are many errors in punctuation, grammar, and/or spelling.</td>
<td>There are many errors in punctuation, grammar, and/or spelling.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
We need to create deliberate teaching measures to help students:

- They start late because they dislike “research” or are lazy: **Break down the research assignment into parts; create an exercise where they get excited or surprised by taking time to interpret.**

- They don’t take the time to collect and/or analyze the evidence: **Create explicit steps for collecting and analyzing evidence.**

- They’ve make up their minds already: **Use reflective critical thinking questions to get them to rethink their habits; show them the difference between summarizing and analyzing.**

- They get overwhelmed by quotes: **Teach how to use key parts of the quotes and work their prose around it; teach how to construct an attribution paragraph.**

- They write in a manner that doesn’t open up “my space”: **Teach a model that forces students to open up “my space” by deliberately focusing on “the other” space first.**
GWS 150: Teach students the difference between summary and analysis by giving an assignment that makes them do both:

Possible Summary Questions:

☐ What is the main purpose of this article? In other words, why do you think this writer has bothered to write this article?

☐ What is the key question(s) the author is addressing?

☐ What evidence is the author using to illustrate and back-up the conclusions? (Facts, experiences, data, etc.)

☐ What are the key conclusions the writer comes to?
GWS 150

How can we teach analysis?


- “**Thinking** is a conscious mental process performed to solve a problem, make a decision, or gain understanding.”
- **Critical thinking** “is the process by which we test claims and arguments and determine which have merit and which do not.”

Invite students to consider key words: “conscious,” “process,” “performed,” “solve,” “decide,” “gain understanding,” “test,” “merit”
Type the answers to each of these prompts in response to the article we have read for class today. You must present your typed answers as entry ticket to class.

- The author’s purpose(s) for writing this article is/are:
- The audience(s) this article seems directed toward is/are:
- This seems to be the intended audience because the language and tone of the article are:
- The key conclusion(s) the author comes to are:
- The context (historical, ethical, political, cultural, environmental, and/or circumstantial conditions) that underlies this article is/are:
- The most important data, facts, and/or experiences (evidence) the author uses to support the conclusions are:
- Some ideas or concepts you would have to understand to understand the author’s reasoning are:
- Some things the author takes for granted that might be questioned are:
- If you take the author’s reasoning seriously, the implication(s) is/are:
- If you fail to take the author’s reasoning seriously, the likely consequences are:
GWS 150: Teach students the difference between summary and analysis by giving an assignment that makes them do both:

A different set of possible analysis questions:

- What is the tone of the article? What is/are the underlying concepts or ideas you would have to understand in order to understand the author’s line of reasoning?
- What is the context of this article? In other words, what are the historical, ethical, political, cultural, environmental, and/or circumstantial settings or conditions that influence and complicate the consideration of the author’s key question?
- Can you imagine anyone who would disagree with this author or article? What would they argue and why?
- What is the author assuming or taking for granted that might be questioned?
- Do you think the author has adequately used evidence to counter those who would disagree? How so? How not?
- Is there anything you disagree with? Why? What evidence would you use to prove your point?
- What new ideas or ways of looking at issues do you take away with you from reading this article?
Another set of possible analysis/reflection questions

- Do you agree or disagree with a source’s viewpoint(s) or with what your examination has led you to discover? (Agree with some points, not with others?) Make a list and note where you agree and/or disagree.

- Decide why you agree or disagree: Did you borrow your reaction from someone else—a parent or friend, a celebrity, a fictional character, the news? If possible, determine what specific experiences conditioned you to agree and/or disagree in the way(s) you do.

- Think of other possible reactions you or someone else might have to the person, issue, or situation.

- Resist your conditioning: Ask yourself whether one of the other reactions also has its merits and why.

- Consider how treating your first reaction or first reading of an article or story as tentative rather than fixed and “right” might add complexity and depth to your understanding of an issue.
How else can we better teach analysis and analytical habits of mind? Remember:

**Analysis** (from Gordon Harvey and the Harvard Writing Center)

“What one does with ‘data’ when one goes beyond observing and summarizing—one takes it apart, grapples with its details, draws out the significance or implication not apparent to a superficial view. Analysis is what makes the writer feel present, as a thinking individual, in the essay.”
Asking Analytical Questions: At the 100 level we need to ask them; at the 200 and 300 level, we need to teach students to ask them.

Asking Good Analytical Questions (from the Harvard Writing Center)

- An important step in writing academic essays is to ask a good analytical question, one that poses a challenging way to address the central text(s) you will write about. Establishing that question won’t be your first step—you’ll need to do some observing and annotating, and even some interpreting, as a way of developing the question itself. But focusing on what that question might be early in your analysis helps you approach your essay with something to explore, an idea to discover (that will inform your thesis) for both you and your readers.

- Think of the question as something you’re truly interested in exploring as you read, an exploration you want to guide your reader through, since not everyone reading the text will come away with the same impressions and interpretations you do. (One of the truisms of writing: if you’re not discovering something in the writing of your essay, your readers probably aren’t either.)
Asking Analytical Questions

Tips to keep in mind:

- “How” and “why” questions generally require more analysis than “who/what/when/where.”

- Good analytical questions can highlight patterns/connections, or contradictions/dilemmas/problems.

- Good analytical questions can also ask about some implications or consequences of your analysis.

- The question should be answerable, given the available evidence, but not immediately, and not in the same way by all readers.

- Your thesis should give at least a provisional answer to the question, an answer that needs to be defended and developed.

- Your goal is to help readers understand why this question is worth answering, why this feature of the text is problematic, and to send them back to the text with a new perspective or a different focus.
Asking Analytical Questions

A good question:

- Speaks to a genuine dilemma or problem in the text. In other words, the question focuses on a real confusion, ambiguity or grey area of the text, about which readers will conceivably have different reactions, opinions, or interpretations.

- Yields an answer that is not obvious (i.e. “How many years was Carothers president of URI?”). In such a question, there’s nothing to explore—it’s too specific and can be answered too easily.

- Suggests an answer complex enough to require a whole essay’s worth of argument. If the question is too vague it won’t suggest a line of argument (i.e. “What happens to Madonna?”). The question should elicit analysis and argument rather than summary or description.

- Can be answered by the text in question, rather than by generalizations or by copious external research.

- Must be answered by using and investigating particularities not just dealing in generalities.

- Reflects the meaning of “analysis” (definition borrowed from Gordon Harvey): “What one does with ‘data’ when one goes beyond observing and summarizing—one takes it apart, grapples with its details, draws out the significance or implication not apparent to a superficial view. Analysis is what makes the writer feel present, as a thinking individual, in the essay.”
Looping back: Based on the need to ask and answer good analytical questions, what are some questions we need to add to the Shero essay assignment to ensure and enhance:

**Goals of analytical and critical thinking:**

- conscious mental process?
- gain understanding?
- What new ideas or ways of looking at issues do you take away with you from reading this article?
- “What one does with ‘data’ when one goes beyond observing and summarizing—one takes it apart, grapples with its details, draws out the significance or implication not apparent to a superficial view. Analysis is what makes the writer feel present, as a thinking individual, in the essay.”
Possible additional analytical questions we could choose from for students to answer at the conclusion of their Shero essay

Assessment workshop participants came up with these on Aug. 30, 2012. Notice the value of two-tiered questioning: What and How/Why

- How does your family structure confirm to and violate societal expectations in terms of gender?
- Why does your Shero’s story matter?
- How do your Shero’s values connect with how they’ve experienced privilege and oppression?
- What did you learn about your Shero as a result of this assignment that most surprised you, and why do you think you were surprised?
- Do you think your interviewee’s specific culture has any positive/negative impact(s) on women’s equal (or unequal?) roles? Howso? Whyso?
- How do you see the questions that could not be answered? What does this silence suggest and why?
- What are the questions you would have liked to ask but did not ask? Why not?
- How would your Shero’s life be different if she’d been born to a different culture or ethnicity? Why is it valuable to consider this question?
Possible additional analytical questions we could choose from for students to answer at the conclusion of their Shero essay

Assessment workshop participants came up with these on Aug. 30, 2012.

- What is the benefit, in your thinking, of mentoring and collaborative relationships between women? Why?
- What components of your relationship with your role model do you seek to replicate with other (younger?) women? Why?
- Has silence played a role in your interviewee’s life at all? How so? What do you believe are the most damaging spaces of silence we risk occupying as women? Why?
- How does what you’ve learned about the woman you admire inform your understanding of the literature for this course?
- How has the scholarship we’ve discussed in class inform your understanding of your subject?
- How has your understanding of the connections between life and scholarship changed, affected, or informed your own thinking about yourself and your place in the world and the choices you are making?
- Identify a choice your shero made at a critical time in her life. Would you make the same decision? Why or why not?
- How has reading and learning about other people’s lives (including those in the class) influenced your understanding of your own life?
GWS 150: Helping students find and represent their thinking selves

We also need to create deliberate teaching measures to help students:

- Recognize how and where they think they are arguing, but they are not. Description and summary are not the same as argument.

- Teach students ways to own the verb, especially in their thesis.
“Analysis is what makes the writer feel present, as a thinking individual, in the essay.”

Unrevised topic sentences from a student critical essay (with permission)
Notice: These are descriptive not argumentative, partly because the writer does not own the verb. “Raffo” or “9 Parts of Desire” literally owns the verb. **Key lesson: If someone else owns the verb, you don’t.**

- 9 Parts of Desire begins and ends with the setting of a river, framing Raffo’s repetitive use of the river as a symbol of life and death.

- Raffo employs the element of pacing through her use of the Muslim “call to prayer” and the “abaya,” a traditional black robe-like garment”(2)

- In 9 Parts of Desire, Raffo utilizes the abaya to transition from character to character.
Old: 9 Parts of Desire begins and ends with the setting of a river, framing Raffo’s repetitive use of the river as a symbol of life and death.

New: The way Raffo frames 9 Part of Desire with a repetitive use of the river as a symbol of life and death helps establish how setting can be crucial for communicating the complexities and emotional landscape of characters.

Old: Raffo employs the element of pacing through her use of the Muslim “call to prayer” and the “abaya,” a traditional black robe-like garment”(2).

New: Raffo’s use of both the Muslim “call to prayer” and the “abaya” as a means of pacing her work reveals how a repeated key image or incident provides a sense of coherence yet also evolution in a dramatic work.

Old: In 9 Parts of Desire, Raffo uses the abaya to transition from character to character.

New: In 9 Parts of Desire, Raffo’s use of the abaya to transition from character to character suggests a deeper idea about how characters might be protean rather than stable or singular.
## GWS 150: Key Critical Thinking Steps (Pre-writing)


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Activity</th>
<th>Definition</th>
<th>Requirements</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Investigation</td>
<td>Finding <strong>evidence</strong>—that is, data that will answer key questions about the issue</td>
<td>Evidence must be</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Relevant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Sufficient</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interpretation</td>
<td>Deciding what the evidence means</td>
<td>The interpretation must be more reasonable than competing interpretations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Judgment</td>
<td>Reaching a <strong>conclusion</strong> about the issue</td>
<td>Conclusion must meet the test of logic</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
We need to create deliberate teaching measures to help students:

- They start late because they dislike “research” or are lazy: Break down the research assignment into parts; create an exercise where they get excited or surprised by taking time to interpret.

- They don’t take the time to collect and/or analyze the evidence: Create explicit steps for collecting and analyzing evidence.

- They’ve make up their minds already: Use reflective critical thinking questions to get them to rethink their habits; show them the difference between summarizing and analyzing.

- They get overwhelmed by quotes: Teach how to use key parts of the quotes and work their prose around it; teach how to construct an attribution paragraph.

- They write in a manner that doesn’t open up “my space”: Teach a model that forces students to open up “my space” by deliberately focusing on “the other” space first.
GWS 150 Interpretation:
Inviting students to examine and use evidence

Close-reading: What does “Jury of Her Peers” have to say about the law? (See handout with quotes.)

- Look closely at these quotes. What do they show us about how the law (and those who represent it) affect others, particularly the women? What do the quotes reveal about the attitude of the law and those who represent it? What qualities characterize the women? Make notes in the margins.

- What key words and ideas arise from examination?

- Create a thesis statement based on these words. What has your examination of evidence led you to see that you might not have seen before?

- If you had to group evidence into like categories, what would you group together? What are the key ideas for each category?
Close-reading: What does “Jury of Her Peers” have to say about the law? Look closely at these quotes. What do they show us about how the law (and those who represent it) affect others, particularly the women? What do the quotes reveal about the attitude of the law and those who represent it? What qualities characterize the women? Make notes in the margins for each quote reflecting what each quote suggests about the law and how it affects the women in this story.

- “I’m glad you came with me,” Mrs. Peters said nervously. 257
- “Now, Mr. Hale,” [Sheriff Peters] said in a sort of semi-official voice. 258
- “Well, Mr. Hale,” said the county attorney in a way of letting what was past and gone go, “tell just what happened when you came here yesterday morning.” 259
- [Mrs. Hale] hoped [Mr. Hale] would tell this straight and plain, and not say unnecessary things that would just make things harder for Minnie Foster. 259
- Mrs. Hale tried to catch her husband’s eye, but fortunately the county attorney interrupted. 260
- Hale did speak guardedly, as if the pencil had affected him too. 261
- And what did you do then?” the county attorney at last broke the silence... Just go on now with the rest of the story.” 262
- “Of course Mrs. Peters is one of us.” 266
- ... dirty pans under the sink, which the county attorney’s disdainful push of the foot had deranged. 266
GWS 150 Interpretation:
Inviting students to examine and use evidence

Close-reading: What does “Jury of Her Peers” have to say about the law?

- “I’d hate to have men comin’ into my kitchen,” [Mrs. Hale] said testily —“snoopin’ round and criticizing.” 266
- “Of course, it’s no more than their duty,” said the sheriff’s wife, in her manner of timid acquiescence. 266
- “I remember the afternoon I put up my cherries.” (Mrs. Hale says this.) 267
- “You coming with me, Mrs. Hale?” [Mrs. Peters] asked nervously. 267
- With a carefulness in which there was something tender, [Mrs. Hale] folded the shabby clothes. 268
- There was something in the other woman’s look that irritated [Mrs. Hale]. 268
- Mrs. Peters had that shrinking manner, and yet her eyes looked as if they could see a long way into things. 268
- “Funny thing to want [the apron],” [Mrs. Peters] ventured in her nervous little way. 268
- A frightened look blurred the other thing in Mrs. Peters’ eyes. 269
Close-reading: What does “Jury of Her Peers” have to say about the law?

- “Oh, I don’t know,” [Mrs. Peters] said, in a voice that seemed to shrink away from the subject. 269
- “Well, I don’t think she did,” affirmed Mrs. Hale stoutly. 269
- “But Mrs. Hale,” said the sheriff’s wife, “the law is the law.” 270
- “The law is the law—and a bad stove is a bad stove.” (Mrs. Hale says this.) 270
- [Mrs. Hale] was startled by hearing Mrs. Peters say: “A person gets discouraged—and loses heart.” 270
- “I don’t think we ought to touch things,” Mrs. Peters said, a little helplessly. 272
- “I’ll just finish up this end,” answered Mrs. Hale, still in that mild, matter-of-fact fashion. 272
- Mrs. Peters in that thin, timid voice… 272
- “I’m glad you came with me, Mrs. Hale… It would be lonesome for me—sitting here alone.” 274
Close-reading: What does “Jury of Her Peers” have to say about the law?

- “Yes...,” agreed Mrs. Hale, a certain determined naturalness in her voice. 276
- “This isn’t her scissors,” said Mrs. Peters, in a shrinking voice. 276
- “Somebody wrung its neck,” said [Mrs. Peters], in a voice that was slow and deep. 276
- “The law has got to punish crime, Mrs. Hale,” [Mrs. Peters] said in her tight little way. 278
- “We mustn’t take it on,” said Mrs. Peters, with a frightened look toward the stairs. 278
- “My! [Mrs. Peters] began, in a high, false voice, “it’s a good thing the men couldn’t hear us.” 279
- But there [Mrs. Peters] broke—she could not touch the bird. She stood there helpless, foolish. 281
- “We call it—knot it, Mr. Henderson.” (Mrs. Hale says this.) 281
Close-reading: What does “Jury of Her Peers” have to say about the law?

**Next step:** Once students (or faculty in assessment in workshop) have annotated quotes, invite them to

- underline key words and concepts that arise
- group like quotes and issues together
- begin to see how close interpretation leads to a new vocabulary one can then use to structure essay, develop topic sentences, and create thesis statement with key terms and ideas that grow out of evidence
- Writing interpretive sentences (see models next) can also help interpreters arrive at key terms and reveal their thinking selves on the page
Writing Interpretive Sentences So As To Reveal Your Thinking Mind

- **Old Style of Sentence**: Interpretation in one sentence. Quotation in one sentence.
- **New Style**: \(<\text{Quotation} + \text{Interpretation}>\) in one sentence

- Why use the order quotation + interpretation? Because interpreting is based on evidence, so your reader wants/needs to see the evidence first: Out of evidence comes interpretation.

- **Three interpretive sentence patterns to play with** (quotes from a Nadine Gordimer story)
  - As you read these over, notice how the interpretation clearly links to the quoted phrase. Readers know interpretation is going on because the second half of the sentence explicitly connects to and pushes beyond the first half.
GWS 150 Interpretation: Writing interpretive sentences

First, things to keep in mind about interpretive sentences:

- Not every sentence is an interpretive sentence.
- Variety is the spice of life.
- The advantage of interpretive sentences is they force you to subordinate plot and emphasize ideas—that is, they force you to stretch your own thinking and come up with concepts and richer language that you can then use in your thesis, topic sentences, etc.
- They show your reader you are a thinking writer, keen to find depth and meaning.
- Done early in the process, after you collect relevant quotes, they generate vocabulary and ideas that make writing topic sentences and theses easier because they make you aware of the significant ideas and reverberations in the text you are writing about.
1) Dependent clause pattern (sentences that begin with when, since, if, after, because, etc.)

- When the stationmaster comes out of a “station with its pointed chalet roof” (228), one gets the idea that those who rule in this story are European.

- While the “flushed and perspiring west” (228) that the train comes from suggests a sense of sweat and hard work, the vendors with their “skin stretched like parchment over their bones” clearly have less vigor and vitality than the trespass the train represents.

- Since the husband “wagged the lion at her” (231), he appears to be boasting about his own prowess.
2) Present participle clause pattern ("ing" words)—make sure the subject after the participial phrase agrees with the phrase, or else you’ll have a (funny?) dangling modifier. You can add the “ing” in brackets.

- “Com[ing] out of the red horizon” as it “bore down on them” (228), the train appears like an incision that could cause the land and people to bleed.

- The “hunk of a sheep’s carcass... dangl[ing] over the stationmaster’s wife (229) suggests the potential destruction the train could bring to those attached to masters.

- The train, “breath[ing] out the smell of meat cooking” (229), bespeaks its own rapacious nature.
3) Appositive and adjectival pattern (ex. of appositive, Emily, my sister, …)

- And yet the natives, “lowly servants squatting” (228), are powerless up against the train’s “flaring,” “big, whisking” body.

- The miniscule hope in this story, the train’s pulling a “dwindling body behind it” (228), might suggest the train is slowly dying, too.

- The train’s path, “a single straight track” (228), suggests the unwavering and inflexible rule of the Europeans over the natives.
GWS 150: Helping students find and represent their thinking selves.

We need to create deliberate teaching measures to help students:

- They start late because they dislike “research” or are lazy: **Break down the research assignment into parts; create an exercise where they get excited or surprised by taking time to interpret.**
- They don’t take the time to collect and/or analyze the evidence: **Create explicit steps for collecting and analyzing evidence.**
- They’ve make up their minds already: **Use reflective critical thinking questions to get them to rethink their habits.**
- They get overwhelmed by quotes: **Teach how to use key parts of the quotes and work their prose around it; teach how to construct an attribution paragraph.**
- They write in a manner that doesn’t open up “my space”: **Teach a model that forces students to open up “my space” by deliberately focusing on “the other” space first.**
Goal of Project: To use and develop skills for doing research that help you 1) thoroughly and accurately present another scholar’s views on a subject and 2) respond and represent your own voice. The steps in this project will help you avoid several pitfalls in doing the kind of research and writing essential for college. These pitfalls include forgetting to write down page numbers; procrastinating; neglecting or not knowing how to cite the author; plagiarizing; losing your own voice in the process of doing research; using long block footnotes that both put your reader (and yourself?) to sleep and neglect your job of processing the research for your reader; letting your research generate a report but not an analysis or argument that extends to represent your views. This project will show you one method for responding to research to help generate and structure your own ideas.
Select important quotes: Choose the article from this semester’s reading that most interests you. Read and re-read it carefully, underlining and/or marking in the margin the most important ideas and sentences that get at the author’s central ideas and argument(s). From your underlining and marks, create a typed list of 10-12 quotes that you feel are the most important for representing the author’s argument. Put quotation marks at the beginning of each quote. At the end of the quote, paginate correctly, following the examples below from Ann Crittenden’s essay “The Mommy Tax.” At the top of the page, make sure to type the title of the work you have chosen (use quote marks if it’s an essay, italics if it’s a book or a movie), and its bibliographic information. Pay attention in the model below to see where quote marks, page references, and punctuation occur; your professors expect you to know and follow proper procedures and will mark you down otherwise.

Pointers: Notice that when you quote you can have an ellipsis (…) in the middle of a sentence where you leave out words, but the quote marks at the beginning and end of the quote do the job of an ellipsis, so you do not use any ellipses here. Notice how when you cite the page number after a quotation, the quote mark goes before the page parenthesis and the period or comma goes after the page parenthesis. When there is no page number, the period and comma go inside the quote mark. Notice with MLA style, no “p.” APA style uses a p. See Student Resources on GWS website.

- “mothers are the most disadvantaged people in the workplace… motherhood is now the single greatest obstacle left in the path to economic equality for women” (366-7).
- “For most companies, the ideal worker is ‘unencumbered,’ that is, free of all ties other than those to his job” (367).
- “A small survey of individuals who provided informal, unpaid care for family members found that it cost them an average of $659,139 in lost wages, Social Security, and pension benefits over their lifetimes” (368)
- “working mothers not only earn less than men, but also less per hour than childless women, even after such differences as education and experience are factored in” (369).
- “Fifteen years after graduation, the woman’s average earnings were almost 40 percent lower ” [than the men’s] (369).
GWS 150 Viewpoint Project:
Step 2: Narrow down long quotes to key phrases or ideas

- **Reduce each quote to its most essential part(s):** Go over Part I. For each quote, underline the key words and ideas within the quote, trying to pare down the longer quotes to their essence—the key phrase(s) or idea(s). Type your new list of narrowed quotes, still using quote marks and pagination accurately. See the model below for an example.

- **Pointers:** By narrowing down the longer quote, you give yourself the key idea(s) you’ll want to wrap your own prose around for the next step. If you use the full long quotes, for one, it takes up a lot of space. Also, it makes reading tedious for the reader who has to read all the long quotes. Most importantly, if you use all of someone else’s words in your writing, you erase yourself from the page. It’s your voice we want to hear, even as you quote from and use the work of someone else. Getting and quoting the core concepts of quotes and then weaving them into your own discussion helps you and your reader feel your presence and [author]ity.
GWS 150 Viewpoint Project:
Step 2: Narrow down long quotes to key phrases or ideas

Help students learn to pick out the key parts of quotes

- “mothers … disadvantaged … motherhood … single greatest obstacle… to economic equality” (366-7).
- “ideal worker … ‘unencumbered’” (367).
- “informal, unpaid care for family… cost… lost wages, Social Security, and pension benefits” (368)
- “working mothers… earn less than men, … less per hour than childless women, even” with same or greater education and experience (369).
- “Fifteen years after graduation,… woman’s average earnings… almost 40 percent lower [than men’s]” (369).
Part III. Write an attribution paragraph (Her/His Space):

This is where you let your reader know openly and clearly that you are presenting someone else’s ideas in a fair and thorough fashion. By first fully presenting someone else’s ideas, you in turn entitle yourself to take space and time afterwards to share your views: Expert’s views first (deference, respect), then yours. The first sentence of the attribution paragraph needs to state the author’s name and essay’s title. The sentence should also include some kind of credential for the writer, so the reader senses this person is an expert worth listening to. The first sentence should also set up the main idea of the source article you’re writing about. (Use the worksheet, Questions to Help Develop Critical Thinking, to help you find the language for this main idea.) Then each sentence should present the source’s view as gathered from your list of narrowed down quotes. Weave your own prose around the essential quotes. You can introduce the ideas chronologically as they appear in the article, or you can organize them in a different way, as long as the logic for your organizing them is clear to the reader.
Viewpoint Project Step 3: Teach students to weave quote snippets into their prose and to use attribution

Pointer: You should use “attribution” and pagination in each sentence where you are using someone else’s words or ideas (otherwise you are plagiarizing).

Notice in the models below the difference between a paragraph that doesn’t have attribution and pagination and one that does. The one without attribution and pages sounds like a list of random ideas. It’s also hard to know whose views are being stated—the student’s or the source’s. Using attribution can serve as glue for the paragraph, allowing you to present many source ideas and not have it feel like a random list. Using attribution also tells the reader you are responsibly, methodically, and respectfully acknowledging someone else’s work.
Paragraph without attribution (without naming the source as source)

“The Mommy Tax” says that “motherhood is the single greatest obstacle… to economic equality.” Mothers are automatically “disadvantaged” in the workplace. Many bosses consider the “ideal worker” to be someone who has no other responsibilities besides work. Some bosses think mothers who work part-time have “a ‘recreational’ attitude” about their jobs. Those who leave work to take care of family members face an enormous loss of “wages, Social Security, and pension benefits.” Working mothers “earn less per hour than childless women,” despite having the same or more education and experience...

Problems:
- List-like and clunky.
- No clarity about who claims what or pg. #s (potential plagiarizing).
- Unclear what is the student’s thought and what comes from the article.
Instead:

In her 2001 essay, “The Mommy Tax,” former New York Times economic reporter Ann Crittenden traces the enormous financial losses mothers face when they decide to step out of the workplace to raise children. Claiming that “motherhood is the single greatest obstacle... to economic equality” (366-7), Crittenden argues that mothers are automatically “disadvantaged” in the workplace (366). She talks about how many bosses consider the “ideal worker” to be someone who has no other responsibilities besides work (367). She says that some bosses think mothers who work part-time have [“a ‘recreational’ attitude”] about their jobs (370). The truth is, Crittenden argues, that those who leave work to take care of family members face an enormous loss of “wages, Social Security, and pension benefits” (368). She reports that working mothers “earn less per hour than childless women,” despite having the same or more education and experience (369)...

Key learning tool: By learning to emphasize and enhance the space a source emphatically “owns,” student in turn sets up to own and emphasize “myspace.”
Part IV: Write your viewpoint based on the article you’ve read (MYspace): This is where you have a chance to let your reader know why your name is at the top of the page: you have a chance now to reflect on and respond to the points and ideas your source made. It will be helpful if the first sentence again refers to the author’s name and title of the essay. That’s your point of departure. Then you have some choices as you respond. You could go back to the list of quotes and respond to each one. Or perhaps you want to respond by discussing the ideas you found most interesting, and go into depth on those ideas. Or perhaps you agreed with some ideas and not with others and you want to discuss why you agree with some, using examples or ideas from your own life, and then go on to discuss why you disagree with others. If your teacher asks you to, you could take a stand and form your own argument in response. The important thing is that your response needs to be as long as, and as weighty as, the attribution paragraph. Otherwise you don’t earn the right to put your name at the top of the essay. Be thoughtful and probing as you go. Maybe you’ll discover new ideas, things you didn’t even know you thought/agreed with/disagreed with until you started this process of responding attentively and critically to the source.
Part IV: Write your viewpoint based on the article you’ve read (MYspace): This is where you have a chance to let your reader know why your name is at the top of the page: you have a chance now to reflect on and respond to the points and ideas your source made. It will be helpful if the first sentence again refers to the author’s name and title of the essay. That’s your point of departure. Then you have some choices as you respond. You could go back to the list of quotes and respond to each one. Or perhaps you want to respond by discussing the ideas you found most interesting, and go into depth on those ideas. Or perhaps you agreed with some ideas and not with others and you want to discuss why you agree with some, using examples or ideas from your own life, and then go on to discuss why you disagree with others. If your teacher asks you to, you could take a stand and form your own argument in response. The important thing is that your response needs to be as long as, and as weighty as, the attribution paragraph. Otherwise you don’t earn the right to put your name at the top of the essay. Be thoughtful and probing as you go. Maybe you’ll discover new ideas, things you didn’t even know you thought/agreed with/disagreed with until you started this process of responding attentively and critically to the source.
Part IV: Write your viewpoint based on the article you’ve read (MYspace)

Part of assignment—student response must be longer than and as weighty as source paragraph to earn the right to put their name at the top.

Points of Discussion as one examines models with students:

- In this version, the student uses “I” freely. It was okay for this assignment, but for another assignment for another course, students need to know their professor might not want you to use the word “I.” Rule: Check with your professor.

- The response is also less analytical than one would want from a 300-level student or an end-of-semester 100-level student. But for students who are learning (again) how to find their space in research, this is a good start.

- It is useful to ask students when they read over this sample: As you read this student’s writing, do you feel her voice coming through? Where? Do you have a favorite part? Where? Why?
After reading Ann Crittenden’s essay about “The Mommy Tax,” at first I felt very surprised. Why and how is it that as a college sophomore, I knew nothing about how stepping out of the workplace could affect such a huge number of lifetime benefits like social security and pensions? Why hasn’t someone told me this? I’ve recently become aware that women are not paid the same as men for the same job, but the thought that women who have children suffer a double whammy when they leave the workforce upsets me. Apparently women also face reduced seniority and difficulty in returning to jobs that pay well when they return to the workplace. These things, just like Crittenden says, will make me have to think more seriously about whether I can afford to have children. I don’t think it’s fair for me to be faced with that choice. Motherhood shouldn’t be an “obstacle to economic equality.” Nor do I believe it’s fair for bosses to believe that “the ideal worker is unencumbered” or to believe that women work only for fun—with “recreational attitudes.” That sounds very condescending to me. Anyone who works and has a family knows that work is not play—it’s a serious way for women to try to fulfill their potential and also bring home an income.
Crittenden also makes me realize what a “disadvantage” it is to work part-time—with low pay and no benefits. It’s interesting to see that when her study was published in 2001, 65 percent of women worked part-time. According to the 2008 statistic listed in the September 2009 U.S. Department of Labor’s Report #1018, 25 percent of women worked part-time. Maybe only 25% work part-time because more women are working full-time, since they know what a loss it is to work part-time while they raise a family.
Paragraph 3:

For me, the scariest piece of information Crittenden shares is how fifteen years after graduation women’s earnings are so much lower than men’s. That means that all the momentum I get from my college degree and maybe graduate school might not matter. As discouraging as it is to learn, too, that working men get unofficially taxed when they help their working wives by doing domestic chores and taking care of kids—they get paid less and risk promotions—maybe it’s good for men to feel the brunt of the “mommy tax,” since maybe they have more power to rebel in the workplace and make things more fair for women. Maybe men can help pressure workplaces to offer daycare within companies or provide ways for women to come back to work without suffering financial losses. But I also think Crittenden is right—as long as our country doesn’t give women the same benefits they give soldiers, as long as women don’t get a continuity of benefits and guarantee of seniority and promotions even when we step out to have children, our country is treating women like second-class incubating machines.
**GWS 150: Critical thinkers/Uncritical Thinkers: Something for students to ponder after they’ve done something that shows them the difference**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Critical Thinkers</th>
<th>Uncritical Thinkers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Are honest with themselves, acknowledging what they don’t know, recognizing their limitations, and being watchful of their own errors.</td>
<td>Pretend they know more than they do, ignore their limitations, and assume their views are error-free.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Regard problems and controversial issues as exciting challenges.</td>
<td>Regard problems and controversial issues as nuisances or threats to their ego.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strive for understanding, keep curiosity alive, remain patient with complexity, and are ready to invest time to overcome confusion.</td>
<td>Are impatient with complexity and thus would rather remain confused than make the effort to understand.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Base judgments on evidence rather than personal preferences, deferring judgment whenever evidence is insufficient. They revise judgments when new evidence reveals error.</td>
<td>Base judgments on first impressions and gut reactions. They are unconcerned about the amount or quality of evidence and cling to their views steadfastly.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Are interested in other people’s ideas and so are willing to read and listen attentively, even when they tend to disagree with the other person.</td>
<td>Are preoccupied with themselves and their own opinions, and so are unwilling to pay attention to others’ views. At the first sign of disagreement, they tend to think, “How can I refute this?”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Jody altered) Recognize that extreme views (whether conservative or liberal) might ignore nuances; practice fair-mindedness.</td>
<td>(Jody altered) Ignore the need for nuance and give preference to views that support their established views.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Looking ahead: GWS at the 300 Level

Assessment focus: Analyze the ways societal institutions and power structures within patriarchal society impact the material realities of women’s lives.

Discoveries:

- Students good at citing and quoting.
- Students good at listing and describing.
- Students not good enough at going into depth and analyzing in complex ways.
GWS 3XX next steps

- Design assignments to emphasize analysis.
- Use critical thinking questions to open discussions and assignments.
- Explicitly teach writing methods at 300-level:
  - Interpreting
  - Analyzing
  - Applying theory
- Make pedagogy transparent to students
- Make teaching writing deliberate with faculty
Methods for achieving WMS 3XX goals

- Give specific guidelines for building a whole essay and a project:
  - Objective, rationale, course of action
  - Research review: summary and analysis (provide guiding questions and prompts)
  - Theoretical understanding and application (teach how to use quote snippets, how to write an interpretive sentence, how to gather key terms, especially how to use counterargument)

- Insist that students workshop and REVISE essays

- Spend time in class having students discuss successful student essays
**WOMEN’S STUDIES – BACHELOR OF ARTS**

**PROGRAM EXPECTATIONS OF STUDENTS - CLASSROOM DISCUSSIONS**

Expected performance levels of students enrolled in Women’s Studies courses across the curriculum (including face-to-face and online classes). Developed using the Association of American Colleges and Universities VALUE Rubrics.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CRITERIA</th>
<th>100-LEVEL</th>
<th>300-LEVEL</th>
<th>400-LEVEL</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>EXPLANATION AND DISCUSSION OF ISSUES</td>
<td>Student states and describes issue/problem to be considered, and begins to define and clarify terms, ambiguities, undetermined boundaries, and/or background information.</td>
<td>Student states, describes, and clarifies issue/problem to be considered and focuses on the need to define and explain terms, ambiguities, undetermined boundaries, and/or background information.</td>
<td>Student clearly states and comprehensively describes issue/problem to be considered critically, including focused attention on clarifying and defining terms, ambiguities, undetermined boundaries, and/or background information, making sure to explain all relevant information necessary for full understanding.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DEMONSTRATION OF EVIDENCE</td>
<td>Student takes information from source(s) and shows the beginning stages of interpretation/evaluation of the evidence. Although student might take viewpoints of experts as mostly fact, student begins to question authorial assumptions and bias.</td>
<td>Student takes information from source(s) and interprets and evaluates evidence to develop a coherent analysis or synthesis. Student questions viewpoints of experts.</td>
<td>Student takes information from source(s) and interprets and evaluates, evidence in order to develop a comprehensive analysis or synthesis. Student thoroughly questions and analyzes viewpoints of experts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INFLUENCE OF CONTEXT AND ASSUMPTIONS</td>
<td>Student questions some assumptions and identifies several relevant contexts when presenting a position. Student may be more aware of others’ assumptions than one’s own (or vice versa).</td>
<td>Student identifies own and others’ assumptions and several relevant contexts when presenting a position.</td>
<td>Student thoroughly (systematically and methodically) analyzes own and others’ assumptions and carefully evaluates the relevance of contexts when presenting a position.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>STUDENT’S POSITION</td>
<td>Student’s specific position (perspective, thesis/hypothesis) acknowledges different sides of an issue.</td>
<td>Student’s specific position (perspective, thesis/hypothesis) takes into account the complexities of an issue. Student acknowledges others’ points of view within her/his position (perspective, thesis/hypothesis).</td>
<td>Student’s specific position (perspective, thesis/hypothesis) is imaginative, taking into account the complexities of an issue. Student acknowledges limits of position (perspective, thesis/hypothesis). Student synthesizes others’ points of view within position (perspective, thesis/hypothesis).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CONCLUSIONS</td>
<td>Student ties conclusions logically to information; student identifies clearly some related outcomes (consequences and implications).</td>
<td>Student ties conclusions logically to a range of information, including opposing viewpoints; student identifies clearly related outcomes (consequences and implications).</td>
<td>Student ties conclusions and related outcomes logically to a range of information (consequences and implications); conclusions reflect student’s informed evaluation and ability to prioritize new ideas, evidence, and perspectives.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# WOMEN’S STUDIES – BACHELOR OF ARTS

## PROGRAM EXPECTATIONS OF STUDENTS - READING EXPECTATIONS

Expected performance levels of students enrolled in Women’s Studies courses across the curriculum (including face-to-face and online courses). Developed using the Association of American Colleges and Universities VALUE Rubrics.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CRITERIA</th>
<th>100-LEVEL</th>
<th>300-LEVEL</th>
<th>400-LEVEL</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>READING COMPREHENSION</strong></td>
<td>Student evaluates how features of a text (language, syntax, structure, tone, etc.) contribute to the author’s argument; student draws basic inferences about the context** and purpose of a text</td>
<td>Student uses the text, general background knowledge, and/or specific knowledge of the author’s context to draw complex inferences about the author’s ideas and attitude.</td>
<td>Student recognizes possible implications of the text for contexts, perspectives, or issues beyond the assigned task within the classroom or beyond the author’s explicit message (ex: might recognize broader issues at play, or might pose challenges to the author’s message and presentation).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>RELATIONSHIPS TO TEXT:</strong> Locating texts within specific knowledge contexts</td>
<td>Student engages texts with the intention and expectation of building topical and world knowledge.</td>
<td><strong>TEXTUAL ANALYSIS</strong> Interacting with texts in parts and wholes</td>
<td>Student identifies relations among ideas, text structure, and/or other textual features, to evaluate how they support an advanced understanding of the text as a whole.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TEXTUAL INTERPRETATION</strong></td>
<td>Student recognizes relations among parts or aspects of a text, such as effective or ineffective arguments, use and/or omission of evidence, in considering how these contribute to a basic understanding of the text as a whole.</td>
<td>Student articulates an understanding of the multiple ways of reading and the range of interpretive strategies particular to one’s discipline(s) or in a given community of readers.</td>
<td>Student provides evidence not only that s/he can read by using an appropriate epistemological lens* but that s/he can also engage in reading as part of a continuing dialogue within and beyond a discipline or a community of readers through the understanding and articulation of the complexity of issues.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Epistemological lens: The knowledge framework a student develops in a specific discipline (ex: WMS) as s/he moves through her/his major. The depth and breadth of this knowledge provides the foundation for independent and self-regulated responses to the range of texts in any discipline or field that students will encounter.

**Context: The historical, ethical, political, cultural, environmental, and/or circumstantial settings or conditions that influence and complicate the consideration of any issues, ideas, artifacts, and events.
# WOMEN’S STUDIES – BACHELOR OF ARTS

## PROGRAM EXPECTATIONS OF STUDENTS - WRITING EXPECTATIONS

Expected performance levels of students enrolled in Women’s Studies courses across the curriculum (face-to-face and online courses). Developed using the Association of American Colleges and Universities VALUE Rubrics.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CRITERIA</th>
<th>100-LEVEL</th>
<th>300-LEVEL</th>
<th>400-LEVEL</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CONTEXT** OF AND PURPOSE FOR WRITING</td>
<td>Student demonstrates awareness of context**, audience, and purpose as they relate to the assigned task.</td>
<td>Student demonstrates consideration and a clear focus on how context**, audience, and purpose relate to the assigned task.</td>
<td>Student demonstrates a thorough and critical understanding of how context**, audience, and purpose relate to the assigned task and incorporates this consideration into an argument that addresses the assigned task.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOPIC SELECTION</td>
<td>Student identifies a topic that relates to the assigned task.</td>
<td>Student identifies a focused and manageable topic that appropriately addresses relevant aspects of the assigned task.</td>
<td>Student identifies a focused and manageable topic that addresses potentially significant and previously less-explored areas or arguments as related to the assigned task.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RESEARCH AND CONTENT DEVELOPMENT</td>
<td>Student demonstrates the use of appropriate, credible, and relevant sources to develop content and explore ideas throughout the work.</td>
<td>Student demonstrates consistent use of appropriate, credible, and relevant sources to explore and support compelling argument, ideas, or content throughout the work.</td>
<td>Student demonstrates skillful use of high-quality, credible, relevant sources to develop ideas and illustrate mastery of the subject, conveying the student’s understanding of the topic and shaping the whole work.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INFORMATION PROCESSING</td>
<td>Student organizes evidence and develops an argument in a logical and consistent manner that leads to a logical conclusion.</td>
<td>Student organizes and analyzes evidence in a logical and consistent manner that reveals important patterns, differences, or similarities, leading to a relevant, clear, and supported conclusion.</td>
<td>Student organizes, analyzes, and synthesizes evidence in a logical and consistent manner that reveals insightful and original patterns, differences, or similarities, leading to a focused, clear, potentially nuanced, and original conclusion.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WRITING MECHANICS</td>
<td>Student uses language that clearly conveys meaning to readers; grammar, punctuation, and spelling are mostly without error.</td>
<td>Student uses fresh and clear language to convey meaning to readers; grammar, punctuation, and spelling are without error.</td>
<td>Student uses clear, compelling, fluid, and graceful language that skillfully communicates meaning to readers; grammar, punctuation, and spelling are without error.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Context: The historical, ethical, political, cultural, environmental, and/or circumstantial settings or conditions that influence and complicate the consideration of any issues, ideas, artifacts, and events.**
Learning Outcomes:

- **Research and content development:** Student demonstrates skillful use of high-quality, credible, relevant sources to develop ideas and mastery of the subject, conveying the student’s understanding of the topic and shaping the whole work.

- **Textual analysis:** Student develops strategies for relating and interrogating ideas, text structure, and/or other textual features in order to build knowledge and insight within and across texts and disciplines.